



**STAFF REPORT
FOR THE
PROPOSED SUGGESTED CONTROL MEASURE
FOR AUTOMOTIVE COATINGS**

**Stationary Source Division
Measures Assessment Branch**

October 2005

**State of California
AIR RESOURCES BOARD**

**STAFF REPORT
FOR THE
PROPOSED SUGGESTED CONTROL MEASURE
FOR AUTOMOTIVE COATINGS**

To be considered by the Air Resources Board on October 20 and 21, 2005, at:

California Environmental Protection Agency
Headquarters Building
1001 "I" Street
Sacramento, California

Stationary Source Division:
Robert Fletcher, Chief
Robert D. Barham, Assistant Chief
Measures Assessment Branch:
Barbara Fry, Chief
Technical Development Section:
Jose Gomez, Manager

This report has been prepared by the staff of the Air Resources Board. Publication does not signify that the contents reflect the views and policies of the Air Resources Board, nor does mention of trade names or commercial products constitute endorsement or recommendation for use.

**State of California
AIR RESOURCES BOARD**

**STAFF REPORT
FOR THE
PROPOSED SUGGESTED CONTROL MEASURE
FOR AUTOMOTIVE COATINGS**

Contributing Authors

David Mehl (Lead)
Nancy Adams
Christian Hurley
Marcia Jorgensen
Reza Mahdavi, Ph.D.
Gary Mouradian
Lynna Negri

Legal Counsel

Diane Kiyota, Esq., Office of Legal Affairs
Robert Jenne, Esq., Office of Legal Affairs

Acknowledgements

We wish to acknowledge the participation and assistance of air pollution control and air quality management districts. In particular, we would like to thank the following district representatives that participated in the ARB/District Working Group:

Dan Belik, Bay Area Air Quality Management District
Victor Douglas, Bay Area Air Quality Management District
Bob McLaughlin, Butte County Air Quality Management District
Dave Valler, Feather River Air Quality Management District
Kevin Williams, Sacramento Metropolitan Air Quality Management District
Steven Moore, San Diego County Air Pollution Control District
Esteban Gutierrez, San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District
Scarlett Noguera, San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District
Laki T. Tisopulos, South Coast Air Quality Management District
Larry Bowen, South Coast Air Quality Management District
Ed Muehlbacher, South Coast Air Quality Management District
Ricardo Rivera, South Coast Air Quality Management District
Stan Cowen, Ventura County Air Pollution Control District
Keith Duval, Ventura, San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District
Rebecca Geyer, Yolo Solano Air Quality Management District
Francisco Donez, U.S. EPA Region IX

We would also like to acknowledge the participation and assistance of:

Akzo Nobel
BASF
Bondo
Cumberland
DuPont
Earl Scheib
Ellis Paint
Fibre Glass - Evercoat
Hentzen
Jones-Blair
Magni
Montana Products
PPG
Sherwin Williams
Spies Hecker
Standex
Valspar

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>PAGE</u>
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	ES-1
 I. BACKGROUND	
A. Overview	I-1
B. Automotive Coatings Manufacturers	I-2
C. Automotive Refinishing Facilities	I-3
D. Regulatory Authority	I-4
1. District Rules in California	I-4
2. The National Automotive Coatings Rule	I-6
3. California Clean Air Act	I-7
 II. DEVELOPMENT PROCESS FOR SUGGESTED CONTROL MEASURE	
A. Automotive Coatings 2002 Survey	II-1
B. Districts and U.S. EPA	II-1
C. Public Process	II-2
D. Evaluation of the District Rules and National Rule	II-3
E. Technology Assessment	II-3
F. Cost Analysis	II-4
 III. PROPOSED SUGGESTED CONTROL MEASURE	
A. Applicability	III-1
B. Definitions	III-1
C. Standards	III-1
D. Administrative Requirements	III-3
E. Test Methods	III-4
 IV. DESCRIPTION AND TECHNICAL ASSESSMENT OF THE COATING CATEGORIES AND SOLVENTS	
A. Introduction	IV-1
B. Categories that are in the SCM	IV-4
1. Adhesion Promoter	IV-4
2. Clear Coating	IV-6
3. Color Coating	IV-7
4. Multi-Color Coating	IV-8
5. Pretreatment Coating	IV-8
6. Primer	IV-10
7. Single-Stage Coating	IV-12
8. Temporary Protective Coating	IV-13
9. Truck Bed Liner Coating	IV-13
10. Underbody Coating	IV-14
11. Uniform Finish Coating	IV-14
12. Any Other Coating Type	IV-15
C. Solvents	IV-17

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>PAGE</u>
V. AMBIENT AIR QUALITY AND EMISSIONS	
A. Ambient Air Quality and the Need for Emission Reductions	V-1
1. Ozone	V-1
2. Fine Particulate Matter	V-3
B. Estimated Emissions from Automotive Coatings	V-9
VI. ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS	
A. Analysis of Reasonably Foreseeable Environmental Impacts of the Methods of Compliance	VI-1
1. Potential Wastewater Impacts	VI-1
2. Air Quality Impacts	VI-2
3. Potential Hazardous Waste Impacts	VI-6
4. Reasonably Foreseeable Feasible Mitigation Measures	VI-7
5. Alternatives to the Proposed SCM	VI-8
B. Community Health and Environmental Justice	VI-8
VII. ECONOMIC IMPACTS	
A. Introduction	VII-1
1. Summary of Economic Impact	VII-1
2. General Approach for Cost Estimation	VII-2
3. Sources and Treatment of Cost Data	VII-3
B. Annual Costs and the Cost-Effectiveness (C.E.) of the Proposed SCM	VII-4
1. Introduction	VII-4
2. Methodology	VII-4
3. Assumptions	VII-5
4. Results	VII-6
C. Economic Impacts on California Businesses	VII-7
1. Legal Requirements	VII-7
2. Potential Impact on California Businesses	VII-7
3. Affected Businesses	VII-7
4. Potential Impact on Employment	VII-10
5. Potential Impact on Business Creation, Elimination, or Expansion	VII-10
6. Potential Impact on Business Competitiveness	VII-10
D. Potential Impacts on California State or Local Agencies	VII-11
E. Potential Impacts on California Consumers	VII-11

APPENDICES

A:	Proposed Suggested Control Measure for Automotive Coatings	A-1
B:	2002 Automotive Coatings Survey	B-1
C:	Summary of Cost Analysis Methodology	C-1
D:	Categories that are not in the SCM	D-1

TABLES

ES-1	Proposed Coating Categories and VOC Limits	ES-3
ES-2	Districts with Automotive Coatings Rules	ES-6
ES-3	Chronology of the Automotive Coatings SCM Development	ES-6
ES-4	Estimated Emission Reductions from Automotive Coatings	ES-10
I-1	Top Seven Coatings Manufacturers	I-2
I-2	Chronology of Development of Coating Technologies	I-3
I-3	Distribution of Automotive Refinishing Facilities Grouped by Total Annual Revenue in 2002	I-4
I-4	Estimated Number of Automotive Refinishing Facilities by District	I-4
I-5	Existing District Rules	I-5
I-6	Summary of VOC Limits	I-6
II-1	List of Public Workshops and Meetings	II-2
III-1	Proposed Coating Categories and VOC Limits	III-2
IV-1	Compliance Summary	IV-2
IV-2	Comparison of Coating Categories	IV-3
IV-3	Basic Physical Parameters	IV-15
IV-4	Technical Feasibility	IV-16
V-1	Ambient Air Quality Standards for Ozone, PM ₁₀ and PM _{2.5}	V-4
V-2	Summary of the 2002 Automotive Coatings Survey	V-9
V-3	Estimated Emissions and Emission Reductions from Automotive Coatings	V-10
VII-1	Changes in Return on Owner's Equity (ROE) for Typical Businesses in the Automotive Refinishing Industry	VII-9

FIGURES

V-1	Population-Weighted Exposure to Ozone Concentrations Above the State Ambient Air Quality Standard	V-2
V-2	2004 Area Designations for State Ambient Air Quality Standards-Ozone	V-6
V-3	2004 Area Designations for State Ambient Air Quality Standards – PM ₁₀	V-7
V-4	2004 Area Designations for State Ambient Air Quality Standards – PM _{2.5}	V-8

ACRONYMS

2002 Survey	2002 Automotive Refinish Survey
APA	Administrative Procedure Act
AQMP	Air Quality Management Plan
ARB/Board	Air Resources Board
ATCM	Airborne Toxic Control Measure
BAAQMD	Bay Area Air Quality Management District
Cal/OSHA	California Department of Industrial Relations, Division of Occupational Safety and Health Administration
CAPCOA	California Air Pollution Control Officers' Association
CCAA	California Clean Air Act
CCR	California Code of Regulations
C.E.	Control Efficiency
CESQG	Conditionally Exempt Small Quantity Generators
CEQA	California Environmental Quality Act
CFR	Code of Federal Regulations
CRF	Capital Recovery Factor
district	Air Pollution Control or Air Quality Management District
DTSC	Department of Toxic Substances Control
EU	European Union
FCAA	Federal Clean Air Act
g/l	Grams Per Liter
HAP	Hazardous Air Pollutant
HEPA	High Efficiency Particulate Abatement
HRA	Health Risk Assessment
HSC	Health and Safety Code
HVLP	High Volume Low Pressure
MEK	Methyl Ethyl Ketone
NAICS	North American Industry Classification System
NAP	Neighborhood Assessment Program
NIOSH	National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health
NO _x	Nitrogen Oxides
OEHHA	Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
OEM	Original Equipment Manufacturer
PCBTF	Parachlorobenzotrifluoride
PEL	Permissible Exposure Limit
PM	Particulate Matter
PM ₁₀	Particulate Matter with an aerodynamic diameter less than or equal to 10 microns
PM _{2.5}	Particulate Matter with an aerodynamic diameter less than or equal to 2.5 microns
ppm	parts per million
REL	Reference Exposure Level
ROE	Return On Owner's Equity
RTS	Ready To Spray
SCAQMD	South Coast Air Quality Management District

ACRONYMS

SCM	Suggested Control Measure
SIC	Standard Industrial Classification
SIP	State Implementation Plan
SJVUAPCD	San Joaquin Valley Unified Air Pollution Control District
SMAQMD	Sacramento Metropolitan Air Quality Management District
SOA	Secondary organic aerosols
SRP	Scientific Review Panel
SWA	Sales-Weighted Average
TAC	Toxic Air Contaminant
TBAC	Tertiary-Butyl acetate
TCLP	Toxicity Characteristic Leaching Procedure
TE	Transfer Efficiency
tpd	tons per day
TSP	Total Suspended Particulate
ug	Microgram
ug/m3	Micrograms per Cubic Meter
U.S. EPA	United States Environmental Protection Agency
VOC	Volatile Organic Compound
VOC _{act}	VOC in grams per liter of coating
VOC _{reg}	VOC in grams per liter of coating, excluding water and exempt compounds